

## **SCHEDULE 'B' TO BYLAW NUMBER 2026 – 0039 (HO-1)**

### **REASONS FOR DESIGNATION OF 31 RIVER STREET**

#### **LOCATED AT SUTTON**

#### **ASSESSMENT ROLL NO.: 060-700**

The property at 31 River Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation, under the categories of design/physical, associative/historical and contextual value.

#### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest**

The church has design and physical value because it is representative of a Gothic Revival church, with elements of other architectural styles. The one-storey building is constructed of red brick, brought from Beaverton to signify the building's importance, rather than using the more readily available local fieldstone. The building has a shallow-pitched roof with returning eaves and cornice at the gable end, with cornices continuing below the eaves along the side of the building, reminiscent of a Georgian style building, and visually connecting it with the adjacent parish hall, which had acted as a place of worship prior to the construction of the church. The primary west façade has a prominent, square tower with corner buttresses, which is surmounted by an ornate octagonal spire-lantern, surrounded by four smaller spires at each corner of the brick tower. The pointed arch entrance door is located on the front face of the tower, with lancet windows at the side elevations, and similarly shaped openings with vents at the second storey of the tower. At the east end of the building is a lower apse with a similarly pitched gable roof. The main body of the church is divided into three bays, articulated by brick pilasters and each containing a large window with a gothic arch. The same window is repeated on the front façade at each side of the tower. Each of the pointed arch windows and lancets have a painted wood label mould with decorative label stops.

A rectangular building was constructed in 1957 at the rear of the building and is not part

of the physical value of the building. The property has historical and associative value because it has direct association with notable community members in Sutton, including James O'Brien Bouchier, who is referred to as the founder of Sutton. He came to Canada in 1818 with his brother William, who returned to England in 1822. He built the grist mill, sawmill and a woolen mill, and the settlement presently known as Sutton was known as Bouchier's Mills for a time. James Bouchier donated 10 acres of cleared land for the St. James Anglican Church in 1845, and he solicited donations from family and friends in England for the construction of the building, which was completed in 1858. The church was consecrated in 1862 by Bishop Strachan, the first Anglican Bishop of Toronto. The chief builder and carver of the church was Martin Mclaughlin, who operated the planning mill in the town, and Robert Till. Martin Mclaughlin was responsible for much of the woodwork throughout the town and is responsible for the interior carving between the chancel and nave. Mclaughlin was also responsible for other prominent buildings in the town, such as the Foresters Hall on High Street.

The property has contextual value as it supports and maintains the historic village character of Sutton as the first church constructed in the community. It is physically, functionally, and historically linked to the adjacent parish hall, together forming a historic church complex. The property is visually and spatially connected to its surroundings through its location within a larger churchyard and cemetery, and its prominent siting at the bend on River Street, where it serves as a recognizable landmark marking the transition from the main commercial corridor of Sutton. Together, the church, and the landscaped churchyard and cemetery form a distinctive civic ensemble within a predominantly residential setting that contributes to the traditional village character of this part of Sutton.

## **STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE**

Under Ontario Regulation 9/06, the property meets the following criteria:

Criterion 1: The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique,

representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method.

Rationale for Designation: The property has design and physical value because it is representative of Gothic Revival church style. The building is clad in red brick, features an ornate tower, peaked windows and doors, and stained glass.

Criterion 4: The property has historical value or associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community.

Rationale for Designation: The property has historical and associative value because it has direct associations with James O'Brien Bouchier (referred to as the founder of Sutton), as his English relatives' generosity made its construction possible in 1857. At the time, there were no other churches in Sutton. The property also has direct associations with the Anglican Church of Canada.

Criterion 6: The property has historical value or associative value because it demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.

Rationale for Designation: The property has associative value because it demonstrates and reflects the work and ideas of chief builder, Martin McLaughlin (who was also responsible for some of the interior carving), and Robert Till.

Criterion 7: The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.

Rationale for Designation: The church is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the character of Sutton, as the first church constructed in the community, reflecting the early development pattern of the village and its nineteenth century origins. Its prominent siting at the bend on River Street gives the church strong visual presence, marking the transition from Sutton's main commercial corridor into a more residential area.

Criterion 8: The property has contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.

Rationale for Designation: The property has contextual value because it is physically, visually, and historically linked to its surroundings and the development of Sutton through

its location within a larger landscaped churchyard and cemetery, which together establish a distinctive civic ensemble within the historic village. The property's relationship with the adjacent parish hall, which functioned as an earlier place of worship, creates a historic church complex.

Criterion 9: The property has contextual value because it is a landmark.

Rationale for Designation: The building's recognizable silhouette, including its brick tower and spire-lantern, makes it a landmark within Sutton.

## **Description of Heritage Attributes**

### Design or Physical Value

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of 31 River Street as a representative example of Georgina's 19th century Gothic Revival style:

- The church's overall height, scale, and rectangular plan with a prominent central tower at the west end and lower apse at the east end.
- The red brick masonry exterior walls.
- The main body of the church, organized into three bays articulated by brick pilasters, each containing a large pointed-arch window with geometric stained glass.
- The shallow-pitched gable roof with returning eaves and continuous cornices at the gable ends and side elevations, recalling Georgian architectural influences.
- The square brick tower on the primary (west) façade, featuring brick corner buttresses, an ornate octagonal spire-lantern, and four smaller corner spires.
- The pointed-arched entrance opening on the front face of the tower, and the lancet window openings on the tower's side elevations, and lancet vent openings on the upper storey.
- The pointed-arch windows on either side of the tower on the west façade, with elaborate stained glass with iconography.
- The painted wood label moulds with decorative label stops above the pointed-arch windows and lancet openings.
- The lower apse at the east end of the building.

- The building's siting within the landscaped churchyard and cemetery.

### Historical or Associative Value

Attributes that contribute to the cultural heritage value of the property at 31 River Street as having direct associations with local craftsmen Martin McLaughlin and Robert Till, religious congregations, and James O'Brien Bourchier:

- The church and churchyard's setting on a treed site, on land donated by James O'Brien Bourchier.
- The exterior woodwork and windows associated with local craftsmen Martin McLaughlin and Robert Till.
- Its location in a town centre, representation of the spread of religious congregations across Georgina in the late 19th and early 20th centuries.

### Contextual Value

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the property at 31 River Street as maintaining the historic character of Sutton and as being physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to its surroundings:

- The church and churchyard's presence in the core of Sutton, contributing to the village character of the area.
- The location of the church at the bend on River Street, creating a terminating vista.
- The property's physical, functional, and historical relationship with the adjacent parish hall, together forming a historic church complex.
- The church's visual and functional connection to the surrounding churchyard and cemetery.