

APPENDIX

APPENDIX C – DETAILED EVALUATION TABLE

		CRITERIA	Planning	User Safety			Active Transportation Network			Transportation Network			Natural and Cultural Environmental Impact	Constructability and Cost	TOTAL SCORE	RANK	COMMENTS
		Objectives	Consistency to Provincial, Regional and Municipal Planning Objectives - Enhances safety and comfort for cyclists	Cyclists - Minimize conflicts for cyclists - Enhances safety and comfort for cyclists	Pedestrians - Minimize conflicts for pedestrians - Enhances safety and comfort for pedestrians	Vehicles - Minimize conflicts for drivers - Enhances safety and comfort for motorists	Build on existing & planned trail networks - Direct access to adjacent communities and key destinations for all modes	Tourism and Recreation - Improves tourism, economic development and recreation use - Promotes access to Town Waterfront Parks	Transportation Equity - Provides fair and accessible environment for users - Provides infrastructure and transportation options for all ages and abilities	Network Connectivity - Changes to road network connectivity - Ensure sufficient connectivity between local and regional roads	Impacts to Residents and Visitors - Minimizes impacts (disruption and nuisance) to residents and business access and out-of-way travel	Emergency Services - Changes to emergency response	- Minimizes impacts on vegetation and trees - Minimize impacts on climate change and Indigenous Histories - Wildlife protection and crossing opportunities	- Prefer options that fit within the existing pavement width - Minimize impacts to utilities and surrounding land use - Feasible and practical to construct - Maintenance efforts and cost - Capital cost and lifecycle cost - Complexity of permitting			
Alternatives		Weighting	4	5	5	3	5	5	5	4	5	5	2	3	204		
			8%	10%	10%	6%	10%	10%	10%	8%	10%	10%	4%	6%	100%		
Section 1	S1-1	Do nothing	Does not add value to achieve objectives	No improvement	No improvement	No changes, still provides two-way travel. Potential for head on collisions; reduced sightlines due to hedges	Does not provide adequate AT connections	No change	No change	Maintains existing road network connections	Maintains existing access and connectivity	Maintains existing emergency response times.	No improvement. Comparatively, higher traffic volumes are a higher risk to animals and vegetation (e.g. animal crossings)	No change	74	5	
	S1-2	Two Lanes - Sharrows	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists; could be supplemented with traffic calming measures	No improvement	No significant change to vehicular level of service	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists or pedestrians.	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists or pedestrians.	Not considered all-ages-and-abilities	Maintains existing road network connections	Maintains existing access and connectivity	Maintains existing emergency response times.	Slight reduction in travel speeds	Sharrow markings and signage	97	4	
	S1-3	One Lane - Paved Shoulders	Improved safety and comfort for pedestrians and cyclists along Lake to Lake Route and Waterfront Parks	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for cyclists, shared with pedestrians and requires cyclists riding contraflow on one side.	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for pedestrians, though they should walk facing the direction of on-coming traffic.	One-way travel eliminates head on collisions, and reduces severity of accidents.	Provides AT connectivity, but paved shoulders are not exclusive to pedestrians and cyclists	Improves walking and cycling experience, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	Provides AAA facility but lower level of service for pedestrians and cyclists than multi-use path.	Lake Drive change to one direction. Network connectivity still maintained through connector roads and parallel The Queensway	One-way travel requires use of Metro Road and connector roads for opposite direction, resulting in some out-of-way travel.	One way Lake Drive requires changes to emergency services responses. Limited impacts due to connecting roads.	Reduction in traffic volumes	Paved shoulder markings and one-way signage	154	2	
	S1-4	One Lane - Multi-Use Path	Most improved safety and comfort for pedestrians and cyclists along Lake to Lake Route and Waterfront Parks	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for cyclists, shared with pedestrians but physically separated from motor vehicles.	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for pedestrians shared with cyclists but physically separated from motor vehicles.	One-way travel eliminates head on collisions, and reduces severity of accidents. Exiting driveways on the MUP side may require drivers to navigate across barriers (e.g. bollards)	Provides AT connectivity	Significantly improves walking and cycling experience, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	Considered all-ages-and-abilities	Lake Drive change to one direction. Network connectivity still maintained through connector roads and parallel The Queensway	One-way travel requires use of Queensway for opposite direction, resulting in some out-of-way travel.	One way Lake Drive requires changes to emergency services responses. Limited impacts due to connecting roads.	Reduction in traffic volumes	Multi-use path markings and one-way signage, and physical separation treatment such as flexible bollards between multi-use path and motor vehicle lane	182	1	Carry Forward
	S1-5	Advisory Lanes	Provides some priority for pedestrians and cyclists	Provides some priority for cyclists but new facility type that would require some education and adjustment period.	Pedestrians can also use the advisory lanes, but not as comfortable as a paved shoulder	Maintains two-way travel but motorists have to move over to advisory lane when there's on-coming traffic while yielding to pedestrians and cyclists. New facility type that may cause some confusion for visitors.	Provides AT connectivity, but lower level of service for pedestrians and cyclists than paved shoulders or multi-use path.	Improves walking and cycling experience, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	Provides AAA facility but lower level of service for pedestrians and cyclists than paved shoulders or multi-use path.	Two way traffic maintained on Lake Drive. Maintains existing road network connections.	Maintains existing access and connectivity. New facility type that may cause some confusion for visitors.	Maintains existing emergency access and connectivity. New facility type that may cause some confusion for visitors.	Slight reduction in travel speeds	Pavement markings and signage	131	3	
Section 2	S2-1	Do Nothing	Does not add value to achieve objectives	No improvement	No improvement	No changes, still provides two-way travel. Potential for head on collisions; reduced sightlines due to hedges	Does not provide adequate AT connections	No change	No change	Maintains existing road network connections	Maintains existing access and connectivity	Maintains existing emergency response times.	No improvement	No change	74	7	
	S2-2	Two Lanes - Sharrows	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists; could be supplemented with traffic calming measures	No improvement	No changes, still provides two-way travel. Potential for head on collisions; reduced sightlines due to hedges	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists or pedestrians.	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists or pedestrians.	Not considered all-ages-and-abilities	Maintains existing road network connections	Maintains existing access and connectivity	Maintains existing emergency response times.	Slight reduction in travel speeds	Sharrow markings and signage	97	6	
	S2-3	One Lane - Paved Shoulders	Improved safety and comfort for pedestrians and cyclists along Lake to Lake Route and Waterfront Parks	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for cyclists, shared with pedestrians and requires cyclists riding contraflow on one side.	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for pedestrians, though they should walk facing the direction of on-coming traffic.	One-way travel eliminates head on collisions, and reduces severity of accidents.	Provides AT connectivity, but paved shoulders are not exclusive to pedestrians and cyclists	Improves walking and cycling experience, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	Provides AAA facility but lower level of service for pedestrians and cyclists than multi-use path.	Lake Drive change to one direction. Network connectivity still maintained through connector roads and parallel Metro Road	One-way travel requires use of Metro Road and connector roads for opposite direction, resulting in some out-of-way travel.	One way Lake Drive requires changes to emergency services responses. Limited impacts due to connecting roads.	Reduction in traffic volumes	Paved shoulder markings and one-way signage	154	2	
	S2-4	One Lane - Multi-Use Path	Most improved safety and comfort for pedestrians and cyclists along Lake to Lake Route and Waterfront Parks	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for cyclists, shared with pedestrians but physically separated from motor vehicles.	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for pedestrians shared with cyclists but physically separated from motor vehicles.	One-way travel eliminates head on collisions, and reduces severity of accidents. Exiting driveways on the MUP side may require drivers to navigate across barriers (e.g. bollards)	Increases the trail and AT network connectivity which provides better access for pedestrians and cyclists	Significantly improves walking and cycling experience, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	Considered all-ages-and-abilities	Lake Drive change to one direction. Network connectivity still maintained through connector roads and parallel Metro Road	One-way travel requires use of Metro Road and connector roads for opposite direction, resulting in some out-of-way travel.	One way Lake Drive requires changes to emergency services responses. Limited impacts due to connecting roads.	Reduction in traffic volumes	Multi-use path markings and one-way signage, and physical separation treatment such as flexible bollards between multi-use path and motor vehicle lane	177	1	
	S2-5	Partial Road Closures	Provides some priority for pedestrians and cyclists	Reduced traffic volume in some parts of the study provides safer and more comfortable space for cyclists. However, this only improves the condition inside the road closure.	Reduced traffic volume in some parts of the study provides safer and more comfortable space for pedestrians. However, this only improves the condition inside the road closure.	Maintains two way travel in other areas, and potential for head on collisions.	Reduced traffic volumes in closed areas improves the comfort and safety for pedestrians and cyclists to access key destinations.	Improves walking and cycling experience by providing safer and more comfortable space to AT mode, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	Provides AAA facility but only partially for some segments of the road.	Disrupted connectivity along Lake Drive, but mitigated by access to parallel Metro Road	Reduced traffic volume and vehicle access to closure areas. This redirects the vehicle traffic to adjacent roads.	Disrupted emergency response along Lake Drive, but mitigated by access to parallel Metro Road	Reduction in traffic volumes	Modal filter (barrier) along with signage	112	4	This can be integrated with the preferred alternative. This alternative by itself would not be feasible. This alternative is being informed by the Waterfront Parks Master Plan.
Section 3	S3-1	Do nothing	Does not add value to achieve objectives	No improvement	No improvement	No changes, still provides two-way travel. Potential for head on collisions; reduced sightlines due to hedges	Does not provide adequate AT connections	No change	No change	Maintains existing road network connections	Maintains existing access and connectivity	Maintains existing emergency response times.	No improvement	No change	74	5	
	S3-2	Two Lanes - Sharrows	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists; could be supplemented with traffic calming measures	No improvement	No changes, still provides two-way travel. Potential for head on collisions; reduced sightlines due to hedges	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists or pedestrians.	Slight improvement by creating more awareness of cycling route, but no dedicated space for cyclists or pedestrians.	Not considered all-ages-and-abilities	Maintains existing road network connections	Maintains existing access and connectivity	Maintains existing emergency response times.	Slight reduction in travel speeds	Sharrow markings and signage	97	4	
	S3-3	One Lane - Paved Shoulders	Improved safety and comfort for pedestrians and cyclists along Lake to Lake Route and Waterfront Parks	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for cyclists, shared with pedestrians and requires cyclists riding contraflow on one side.	Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for pedestrians, though they should walk facing the direction of on-coming traffic.	One-way travel eliminates head on collisions, and reduces severity of accidents.	Provides AT connectivity, but paved shoulders are not exclusive to pedestrians and cyclists	Improves walking and cycling experience, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	Provides AAA facility but lower level of service for pedestrians and cyclists than multi-use path.	Lake Drive change to one direction. Network connectivity disrupted as limited connectivity to parallel road or connector roads.	One-way travel requires use of Black River Road, however, there are limited connector roads resulting in higher out-of-way travel.	One way Lake Drive requires changes to emergency services responses. Impacts due to limited parallel and connecting roads.	Reduction in traffic volumes	Paved shoulder markings and one-way signage	127	3	

		CRITERIA	Planning	User Safety			Active Transportation Network	Transportation Network			Natural and Cultural Environmental Impact	Constructability and Cost	TOTAL SCORE	RANK	COMMENTS		
		Objectives	Consistency to Provincial, Regional and Municipal Planning Objectives	Cyclists - Minimize conflicts for cyclists - Enhances safety and comfort for cyclists	Pedestrians - Minimize conflicts for pedestrians - Enhances safety and comfort for pedestrians	Vehicles - Minimize conflicts for drivers - Enhances safety and comfort for motorists	Build on existing & planned trail networks - Direct access to adjacent communities and key destinations for all modes	Tourism and Recreation - Improves tourism, economic development and recreation use - Promotes access to Town Waterfront Parks	Transportation Equity - Provides fair and accessible environment for users - Provides infrastructure and transportation options for all ages and abilities	Network Connectivity - Changes to road network connectivity - Ensure sufficient connectivity between local and regional roads	Impacts to Residents and Visitors - Minimizes impacts (disruption and nuisance) to residents and business access and out-of-way travel	Emergency Services - Changes to emergency response	- Minimize impacts on vegetation and trees - Minimize impacts on climate change and Indigenous Histories - Wildlife protection and crossing opportunities	- Prefer options that fit within the existing pavement width - Minimize impacts to utilities and surrounding land use - Feasible and practical to construct - Maintenance efforts and cost - Capital cost and lifecycle cost - Complexity of permitting			
Alternatives		Weighting	4	5	5	3	5	5	5	4	5	5	2	3	204		
			8%	10%	10%	6%	10%	10%	10%	8%	10%	10%	4%	6%	100%		
	S3-4	One Lane - Multi-Use Path	● 4 Most improved safety and comfort for pedestrians and cyclists along Lake to Lake Route and Waterfront Parks	● 4 Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for cyclists, shared with pedestrians but physically separated from motor vehicles.	● 4 Reduced traffic volume and provides designated space for cyclists but physically separated from motor vehicles.	● 2 One-way travel eliminates head on collisions, and reduces severity of accidents. ● 2 Existing driveways on the MUP side may require drivers to navigate across barriers (e.g. bollards)	● 4 Provides AT connectivity	● 4 Significantly improves walking and cycling experience, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	● 4 Considered all-ages-and-abilities	● 1 Lake Drive change to one direction. Network connectivity disrupted as limited connectivity to parallel road or connector roads.	● 1 One-way travel requires use of Black River Road, however, there are limited connector roads resulting in higher out-of-way travel.	● 1 One way Lake Drive requires changes to emergency services responses. Impacts due to limited parallel and connecting roads.	● 4 Reduction in traffic volumes	● 2 Multi-use path markings and one-way signage, and physical separation treatment such as flexible bollards between multi-use path and motor vehicle lane	150	1	This alternative alone would not be feasible for the full Section 3. A qualitative analysis was completed inform a combination of alternatives appropriate for each Segment of Section 3. See the Final Report for the full analysis.
	S3-5	Advisory Lanes	● 2 Provides some priority for pedestrians and cyclists	● 3 Provides some priority for cyclists but new facility type that would require some education and adjustment period.	● 2 Pedestrians can also use the advisory lanes, but not as comfortable as a paved shoulder	● 2 Maintains two-way travel but motorists have to move over to advisory lane when there's on-coming traffic while yielding to pedestrians and cyclists. New facility type that may cause some confusion for visitors.	● 2 Provides AT connectivity, but lower level of service for pedestrians and cyclists than paved shoulders or multi-use path.	● 3 Improves walking and cycling experience, which can attract more tourism and economic development.	● 2 Provides all-ages-and-abilities facility but lower level of service for pedestrians and cyclists than paved shoulders or multi-use path.	● 4 Two way traffic maintained on Lake Drive. Maintains existing road network connections.	● 3 Maintains existing access and connectivity. New facility type that may cause some confusion for visitors.	● 3 Maintains existing emergency access and connectivity. New facility type that may cause some confusion for visitors.	● 4 Reduction in traffic volumes	● 3 Pavement markings and signage	137	2	